

# Nonseparating vertices in tournaments with large minimum degree

KEIKO KOTANI

*Department of Mathematics  
Science University of Tokyo  
Wakamiya 26, Shinjuku-ku  
Tokyo, 162-0827  
Japan*

kkotani@rs.kagu.tus.ac.jp

## Abstract

Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament, and let  $p \geq 1$  be an integer. We show that if  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , then  $T$  has at least  $k = \min\{|V(T)|, 4p - 2\}$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$ ) is strongly connected. We also show that if  $p \geq 2$ ,  $|V(T)| \geq 4p$ , and  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , then  $T$  has at least  $4p - 1$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p-1}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p - 1$ ) is strongly connected. Further we show that if  $p \geq 2$ ,  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 1$ , and  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , then  $T$  has at least  $4p$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p$ ) is strongly connected unless  $p = 2$  and  $|V(T)| = 4p + 1$ .

## 1 Introduction

In this paper, we consider only simple digraphs, that is finite directed graphs without loops or multiple edges. Let  $T = (V(T), E(T))$  be a tournament, i.e., a simple digraph such that for any  $x, y \in V(T)$  with  $x \neq y$ , precisely one of  $xy$  and  $yx$  belongs to  $E(T)$ . For a subset  $X$  of  $V(T)$ , we let  $\langle X \rangle = \langle X \rangle_T$  denote the tournament induced by  $X$ . For  $v \in V(T)$ , we let  $T - v$  denote the tournament from  $T$  by deleting  $v$ ; thus  $T - v = \langle V(T) - \{v\} \rangle$ . For disjoint subsets  $A$  and  $B$  of  $V(T)$ , we let  $E(A, B)$  denote the set of edges joining  $A$  to  $B$  and let  $e(A, B)$  denote the cardinality of  $E(A, B)$ . For  $v \in V(T)$ , we let  $\deg_T^+(v) = e(\{v\}, T - \{v\})$  and  $\deg_T^-(v) = e(T - \{v\}, \{v\})$ . Let  $C$  be a cycle of  $T$ . For  $v \in V(C)$ , we denote by  $v^-$  and  $v^+$  the predecessor and the successor of  $v$  on  $C$ , respectively, and we denote by  $v^+Cv$  the directed path from  $v^+$  to  $v$  on  $C$ .

If  $T$  is a tournament such that any two vertices in  $V(T)$  are connected by a directed path, then we say  $T$  is strongly connected.

The following theorem by J. W. Moon [2] is well-known.

**Theorem A.** *Each vertex of a strongly connected tournament  $T$  is contained in a cycle of length  $k$ , for  $k = 3, 4, \dots, |V(T)|$ .*

By Theorem A, the following theorem is obtained immediately.

**Theorem B (Lovász [1]).** *Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4$ . Then  $T$  has two vertices  $x_1, x_2$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ) is strongly connected.*

In addition, C. Thomassen [3] proved the following theorem:

**Theorem C.** *Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament. Set  $n = |V(T)|$ . Then  $T$  has three vertices  $x_1, x_2, x_3$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, 3$ ) is strongly connected, unless  $T$  is isomorphic to  $Q_n$ , where  $Q_n$  is the tournament consisting of a path  $v_1v_2 \dots v_n$  and all edges  $v_i v_j$  such that  $i > j + 1$ .*

In this paper, we prove the following variants on Theorems B and C with large minimum degree:

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer and set  $k = \min\{|V(T)|, 4p - 2\}$ . Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament. Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then  $T$  has  $k$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$ ) is strongly connected.*

**Theorem 2.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer and set  $k = 4p - 1$ . Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4p$ . Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then  $T$  has  $k$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$ ) is strongly connected.*

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer and set  $k = 4p$ . Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 1$ . Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . In the case where  $p = 2$ , suppose further that  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 2$ . Then  $T$  has  $k$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$ ) is strongly connected.*

By Theorems B and 1, we obtain the following corollary:

**Corollary 4.** *Let  $p \geq 1$  be an integer and set  $k = \min\{|V(T)|, 4p - 2\}$ . Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4$ . Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then  $T$  has  $k$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$ ) is strongly connected.*

Theorems 1, 2 and 3 can be proved by Theorems 5, 6 and 7, respectively.

**Theorem 5.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament. Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then for every  $X \subset V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq \min\{|V(T)| - 1, 4p - 3\}$ , there exists a cycle  $C$  such that  $X \subset V(C)$  and  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Theorem 6.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4p$ . Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then for every  $X \subset V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq 4p - 2$ , there exists a cycle  $C$  such that  $X \subset V(C)$  and  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Theorem 7.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament with  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 1$ . Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . In the case where  $p = 2$ , suppose further that  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 2$ . Then for every  $X \subset V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq 4p - 1$ , there exists a cycle  $C$  such that  $X \subset V(C)$  and  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ .*

In Section 2, we prove several preliminary results, and we prove Theorems 1, 2 and 3 by Theorems 5, 6 and 7, respectively. We prove Theorems 5, 6 and 7 in Section 3. In Section 4, we discuss the sharpness of the various conditions in theorems.

## 2 Preliminaries

First we prove the following lemma:

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament, and let  $q$  be an integer such that  $1 \leq q \leq |V(T)| - 1$ . Suppose that for every  $X \subset V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq q$ , there exists a cycle  $C$  such that  $X \subset V(C)$  and  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ . Then  $T$  has  $q + 1$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{q+1}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, q + 1$ ) is strongly connected.*

**Proof.** We set  $X_0 = \{x \in V(T) \mid T - x \text{ is strongly connected}\}$ . By way of contradiction, we assume that  $|X_0| \leq q$ . By the assumption of this lemma, there exists a cycle  $C$  such that  $X_0 \subset V(C)$  and  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ . Write  $V(T) - V(C) = \{v\}$ , then  $v \notin X_0$ . On the other hand, since  $C$  is a cycle such that  $V(C) = V(T - v)$ ,  $T - v$  is strongly connected, thus  $v \in X_0$ . Thus we obtain a contradiction.  $\square$

By Lemma 1, Theorems 5, 6 and 7 imply Theorems 1, 2 and 3, respectively. We use the following two lemmas in the proof of Theorems 5, 6 and 7.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $p \geq 1$  be an integer, and let  $T$  be a tournament. Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , or  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then  $|V(T)| \geq 2p + 1$ .*

**Proof.** We set  $n = |V(T)|$ . By symmetry, we may assume that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Then  $\sum_{x \in V(T)} \deg_T^+(x) \geq np$ . On the other hand,  $\sum_{x \in V(T)} \deg_T^+(x) = \frac{n(n-1)}{2}$ . Therefore we obtain  $\frac{n(n-1)}{2} \geq np$ , (and hence  $n \geq 2p + 1$ ).  $\square$

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $p \geq 1$  be an integer, and let  $T$  be a tournament. Suppose that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$  and there exists a vertex  $x \in V(T)$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p + 1$ , or  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$  and there exists a vertex  $x \in V(T)$  such that  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p + 1$ . Then  $|V(T)| \geq 2p + 2$ .*

**Proof.** We set  $n = |V(T)|$ . By symmetry, we may assume that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$  and there exists a vertex  $x \in V(T)$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p + 1$ . Then  $\sum_{x \in V(T)} \deg_T^+(x) \geq np + 1$ . On the other hand,  $\sum_{x \in V(T)} \deg_T^+(x) = \frac{n(n-1)}{2}$ . Therefore we obtain  $n \geq 2p + 1 + \frac{1}{n}$ , and hence  $n \geq 2p + 2$ .  $\square$

### 3 Proof of Theorems

Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T$  be a strongly connected tournament such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ . Let  $X$  be a subset of  $V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq \min\{|V(T)| - 1, 4p - 1\}$ . Let  $C$  be a cycle or a vertex of  $T$  such that  $V(T) - V(C) - X \neq \emptyset$ . We assume that we have chosen  $C$  so that  $|V(C) \cap X|$  is maximal, and so that  $|V(C)|$  is maximal under the condition that  $|V(C) \cap X|$  is maximal. Note that  $V(C) \cap X \neq \emptyset$ . We set

$$\begin{aligned} X^+ &= \{v \in X - V(C) \mid E(\{v\}, V(C)) = \emptyset\}; \\ X^- &= \{v \in X - V(C) \mid E(V(C), \{v\}) = \emptyset\}; \\ Y^+ &= \{v \in V(T) - X - V(C) \mid E(\{v\}, V(C)) = \emptyset\}; \text{ and} \\ Y^- &= \{v \in V(T) - X - V(C) \mid E(V(C), \{v\}) = \emptyset\}. \end{aligned}$$

Under this notation, we prove the following claims.

**Claim 1.**  $X - V(C) = X^+ \cup X^-$ .

**Proof.** Assume that there exists a vertex  $v \in X - V(C)$  such that  $E(\{v\}, V(C)) \neq \emptyset$  and  $E(V(C), \{v\}) \neq \emptyset$ . Then there exist consecutive vertices  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  on  $C$  such that  $v_1v \in E(T)$  and  $vv_2 \in E(T)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = v_1vv_2Cv_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ .  $\square$

**Claim 2.**  $E(X^+, X^-) = \emptyset$ .

**Proof.** Assume that  $E(X^+, X^-) \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $u \in X^+$  and  $v \in X^-$  be vertices such that  $uv \in E(X^+, X^-)$ . Let  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  be consecutive vertices on  $C$ , then  $v_1u \in E(T)$  and  $vv_2 \in E(T)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = v_1uvv_2Cv_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ .  $\square$

**Claim 3.**  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \leq 2$ . Suppose that  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 2$ , then  $|Y^+| = |Y^-| = 1$ .

**Proof.** First show that if  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \geq 2$ , then  $V(T) - V(C) - X = Y^+ \cup Y^-$ . Assume that  $V(T) - V(C) - X - Y^+ \cup Y^- \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $v \in V(T) - V(C) - X - Y^+ \cup Y^-$ . Then there exist consecutive vertices  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  on  $C$  such that  $v_1v \in E(T)$  and  $vv_2 \in E(T)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = v_1vv_2Cv_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C)|$ . Here we obtain if  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \geq 2$ , then  $V(T) - V(C) - X = Y^+ \cup Y^-$ .

Now we prove Claim 3. Assume that  $|Y^+| \geq 2$  or  $|Y^-| \geq 2$ , i.e.,  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \geq 2$ . Then  $V(T) - V(C) - X = Y^+ \cup Y^-$ . This together with Claim 1 implies  $V(T) - V(C) = X^+ \cup X^- \cup Y^+ \cup Y^-$ . Since  $T$  is strongly connected,  $X^+ \cup Y^+ \neq \emptyset$ ,  $X^- \cup Y^- \neq \emptyset$ , and  $E(X^+ \cup Y^+, X^- \cup Y^-) \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $u \in X^+ \cup Y^+$  and  $v \in X^- \cup Y^-$  be vertices such that  $uv \in E(X^+ \cup Y^+, X^- \cup Y^-)$ . Let  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  be consecutive vertices on  $C$ , then  $v_1u \in E(T)$  and  $vv_2 \in E(T)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = v_1uvv_2Cv_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C)|$ . Here we obtain  $|Y^+| \leq 1$  and  $|Y^-| \leq 1$ . Thus  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \leq 2$ , and if  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 2$ , then  $|Y^+| = |Y^-| = 1$ .  $\square$

**Claim 4.** *Suppose that  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 2$ . Then  $E(X^+, Y^-) = \emptyset$  and  $E(Y^+, X^-) = \emptyset$ .*

**Proof.** Assume that  $E(X^+, Y^-) \neq \emptyset$  or  $E(Y^+, X^-) \neq \emptyset$ . By symmetry, we may assume that  $E(X^+, Y^-) \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 3, we can write  $Y^- = \{v\}$ . Let  $u \in X^+$  such that  $uv \in E(T)$ . Let  $v_1$  and  $v_2$  be consecutive vertices on  $C$ , then  $v_1u \in E(T)$  and  $vv_2 \in E(T)$ . Then there exists a cycle  $C' = v_1uvv_2Cv_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ .  $\square$

**Claim 5. (i)** *If  $X^+ \neq \emptyset$ , then  $|X^+| \geq 2p - 1$ . If  $X^- \neq \emptyset$ , then  $|X^-| \geq 2p - 1$ .*

**(ii)** *If there exists a vertex  $x \in X^+$  such that  $E(\{x\}, V(T) - V(C) - X) = \emptyset$ , then  $|X^+| \geq 2p$ . If there exists a vertex  $x \in X^-$  such that  $E(V(T) - V(C) - X, \{x\}) = \emptyset$ , then  $|X^-| \geq 2p$ .*

**Proof.** (i) Let  $x \in X^+$ . By Claims 1 through 4 and the definition of  $X^+$ ,  $e(\{x\}, V(T) - X^+) = e(\{x\}, Y^+) \leq 1$ , and hence  $\deg_{\langle X^+ \rangle}^+(x) \geq p - 1$ . By applying Lemma 2 to the tournament  $\langle X^+ \rangle$ , we obtain  $|X^+| \geq 2p - 1$ . Similarly, if  $X^- \neq \emptyset$ , then  $|X^-| \geq 2p - 1$ .

(ii) Let  $x \in X^+$  such that  $E(\{x\}, V(T) - V(C) - X) = \emptyset$ . Then by Claims 1 and 2 and the definition of  $X^+$ ,  $e(\{x\}, V(T) - X^+) = 0$ , and hence  $\deg_{\langle X^+ \rangle}^+(x) \geq p$ . By applying Lemma 3 to the tournament  $\langle X^+ \rangle$ , we obtain  $|X^+| \geq 2p$ . Similarly, if there exists a vertex  $x \in X^-$  such that  $E(V(T) - V(C) - X, \{x\}) = \emptyset$ , then  $|X^-| \geq 2p$ .  $\square$

**Claim 6.**  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 1$ .

**Proof.** Assume that  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| \geq 2$ . By Claim 3,  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 2$  and  $|Y^+| = |Y^-| = 1$ . Write  $Y^+ = \{y_1\}$ . By Claims 1 through 4,  $E(\{y_1\}, V(T)) \subset E(\{y_1\}, X^+ \cup Y^-)$ . On the other hand,  $|Y^-| = 1$  and  $\deg_T^+(y_1) \geq p \geq 2$ , and hence  $E(\{y_1\}, X^+) \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $x_1 \in X^+$  be a vertex such that  $y_1x_1 \in E(T)$ . Then by Claims 1 through 4 and the definition of  $X^+$ ,  $E(\{x_1\}, V(T) - V(C) - X) = \emptyset$ , and hence  $|X^+| \geq 2p$  by Claim 5(ii). Similarly,  $|X^-| \geq 2p$ . Consequently we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} |X| &\geq |V(C) \cap X| + |X^+| + |X^-| \\ &\geq 1 + 2p + 2p \\ &= 4p + 1, \end{aligned}$$

which contradicts  $|X| \leq \min\{|V(T)| - 1, 4p - 1\}$ .  $\square$

**Claim 7.** *If  $X \subset V(C)$ , then  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Proof.** By Claim 6, we obtain this claim immediately.  $\square$

Until the end of Claim 9, we assume that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 1,  $X = X^+ \cup X^-$ , and hence we may assume that  $X^+ \neq \emptyset$  by symmetry. By Claim 6,  $V(T) - V(C) - X$  consists of a single vertex, say  $y_0$ .

**Claim 8.** *Suppose that  $X^- = \emptyset$ . Then the following hold.*

- (i) *There exists a path  $P = x_1x_2 \cdots x_{|X^+|}y_0$  ( $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{|X^+|} \in X^+$ ), i.e.,  $V(P) = \{y_0\} \cup X^+$  and  $P$  has  $y_0$  as the endvertex.*
- (ii) *Suppose that  $|V(C) - X| \geq 2$ , or  $|V(C) - X| = 1$  and  $e(\{y_0\}, V(C) \cap X) \geq 1$ . Then  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq |X^+|$ .*
- (iii) *Suppose that  $|V(C) - X| = 1$  and  $e(\{y_0\}, V(C) \cap X) = 0$ . Then  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p$ .*
- (iv)  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p - 1$ .
- (v) *If  $|V(T) - X| \geq 2$ , then  $E(\{y_0\}, X^+) = \emptyset$ .*

**Proof.** Note that since  $X^- = \emptyset$ , and since  $T$  is strongly connected,  $E(\{y_0\}, V(C)) \neq \emptyset$ .

(i) Let  $P$  be a path such that  $V(P) \cap X^+ \neq \emptyset$  and  $P$  has  $y_0$  as the endvertex (there exists such a path  $P$  since  $E(X^+, \{y_0\}) \neq \emptyset$ ). We assume that we have chosen  $P$  so that  $|V(P) \cap X^+|$  is maximal. In order to show  $X^+ \subset V(P)$ , we assume that  $X^+ - V(P) \neq \emptyset$ . For each vertex  $x \in X^+ - V(P)$ ,  $E(\{x\}, V(P)) = \emptyset$  by the maximality of  $|V(P) \cap X^+|$ . Then  $E(X^+ - V(P), V(T) - (X^+ - V(P))) = \emptyset$ , which contradicts the assumption that  $T$  is strongly connected. Hence  $X^+ - V(P) = \emptyset$ , thus  $X^+ \subset V(P)$ .

(ii) By the assumption of (ii), there exists  $v \in V(C)$  such that  $y_0v \in E(G)$  and  $V(C) - X - \{v\} \neq \emptyset$ , say  $v_0$ . By (i), there exists a path  $P = x_1x_2 \cdots x_{|X^+|}y_0$  ( $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{|X^+|} \in X^+$ ). Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = Pv_0x_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ . By the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ ,  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq |V(C') \cap X| = |X^+|$ .

(iii) Let  $v_0 \in V(C)$  be a vertex such that  $y_0v_0 \in E(T)$ . By the assumption of (iii),  $v_0 \notin X$ . Since  $\deg_T^-(v_0) \geq p \geq 2$ ,  $E(V(C) - \{v_0\}, \{v_0\}) = E(V(C) \cap X, \{v_0\}) \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $v_1 \in V(C) \cap X$  such that  $v_1v_0 \in E(T)$ . Then  $\deg_{(V(C) \cap X)}^-(v_1) \geq p$ , and  $\deg_{(V(C) \cap X)}^-(v) \geq p - 1$  for all  $v \in V(C) \cap X - \{v_1\}$ . By applying Lemma 3 to the tournament  $\langle V(C) \cap X \rangle$ , we obtain  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p$ .

(iv) If  $|V(C) - X| \neq 0$ , then  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p - 1$  by (ii) and Claim 5(i), and (iii). If  $|V(C) - X| = 0$ , then  $\deg_{(V(C))}^-(x) \geq p - 1$  for all  $x \in V(C) \cap X = V(C)$ . By applying Lemma 2 to the tournament  $\langle V(C) \rangle$ , we obtain  $|V(C)| = |V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p - 1$ .

(v) We assume that  $E(\{y_0\}, X^+) \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $x_0 \in X^+$  be a vertex such that  $y_0x_0 \in E(T)$ , then  $E(\{x_0\}, V(T) - V(C) - X) = \emptyset$ , and hence  $|X^+| \geq 2p$  by Claim 5(ii). Since  $V(C) - X \neq \emptyset$  by the assumption of (v), (ii) or (iii) holds. Hence  $|X| = |V(C) \cap X| + |X^+| \geq 4p$ , which contradicts  $|X| \leq \min\{4p - 1, |V(T)| - 1\}$ .  $\square$

**Claim 9.** *Suppose that  $|V(T) - X| \geq 2$ . Then  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ ,  $|V(C)| \geq 3$ , and  $X^- = \emptyset$ .*

**Proof.** By Claim 6, we have  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ . This together with  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 1$  implies  $|V(C)| \geq 3$ . Let  $v_0 \in V(C) - X$ . Assume that  $X^- \neq \emptyset$ . Since  $T$  is strongly connected,  $E(X^+, \{y_0\}) \neq \emptyset$  and  $E(\{y_0\}, X^-) \neq \emptyset$  by Claim 2. Let  $x_1 \in X^+$  such

that  $x_1y_0 \in E(T)$ , and let  $x_2 \in X^-$  such that  $y_0x_2 \in E(T)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = v_0^-x_1y_0x_2v_0^+Cv_0^-$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$ , which contradicts the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ .  $\square$

**Proof of Theorem 5.**

Let  $p$  and  $T$  be as in Theorem 5. Let  $X$  be a subset of  $V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq \min\{|V(T)| - 1, 4p - 3\}$ , and  $C, X^+, X^-$  be as in the paragraph preceding the statement of Claim 1. In order to obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , we assume that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 1, we may assume  $X^+ \neq \emptyset$  by symmetry. By Claim 5 (i),  $|X^+| \geq 2p - 1$ . In the case where  $X^- \neq \emptyset$ ,  $|X^-| \geq 2p - 1$  by Claim 5 (i). Hence  $|X| = |X \cap V(C)| + |X^+| + |X^-| \geq 1 + 2p - 1 + 2p - 1 = 4p - 1$ , which contradicts the definition of  $X$ . In the case where  $X^- = \emptyset$ ,  $|X| = |X \cap V(C)| + |X^+| \geq 4p - 2$  by Claim 8 (iv), which also contradicts the definition of  $X$ . Here we obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , and hence  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$  by Claim 7. This completes the proof of Theorem 5.  $\square$

**Proof of Theorem 6.**

Let  $p$  and  $T$  be as in Theorem 6. Let  $X$  be a subset of  $V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq 4p - 2$ , and  $C, X^+, X^-$  be as in the paragraph preceding the statement of Claim 1. In order to obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , we assume that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 1, we may assume that  $X^+ \neq \emptyset$  by symmetry. By Claim 6,  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 1$ . Let  $y_0$  be as in the paragraph preceding the statement of Claim 8. Since  $|V(T)| \geq 4p$ ,  $|V(T) - X| \geq 2$ , and hence  $X^- = \emptyset$  and  $|V(C)| \geq 3$  by Claim 9. We write the cycle  $C = v_1v_2 \dots v_lv_1 (l \geq 3)$ . By Claim 8(v), there exist two vertices  $v_i, v_j \in V(C)$  ( $1 \leq i < j \leq l$ ) such that  $y_0v_i, y_0v_j \in E(T)$ . By Claim 9,  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ . This together with  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 1$  implies that one of the following holds (subscripts of the letter  $v$  are to be read modulo  $l$ ):

- (1)  $|\{v_i, \dots, v_{j-1}\} \cap X| \geq 1$  and  $|\{v_j, \dots, v_{i-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ ; or
- (2)  $|\{v_j, \dots, v_{i-1}\} \cap X| \geq 1$  and  $|\{v_i, \dots, v_{j-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ .

By symmetry, we may assume that (1) holds. By Claim 8 (i), there exists a path  $P = x_1x_2 \dots x_{|X^+|}y_0 (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{|X^+|} \in X^+)$ . Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = Pv_iCv_{j-1}x_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$  and  $|V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 1$ . By Claim 5(i),  $|X^+| \geq 2p - 1$ . By the maximality of  $|V(C) \cap X|$ ,  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq |V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 1 \geq 2p$ . Consequently,  $|X| = |V(C) \cap X| + |X^+| \geq 4p - 1$ , which contradicts the definition of  $X$ . Here we obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , and hence  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$  by Claim 7. This completes the proof of Theorem 6.  $\square$

**Proof of Theorem 7.**

Let  $p$  and  $T$  be as in Theorem 7. Let  $X$  be a subset of  $V(T)$  such that  $|X| \leq 4p - 1$ , and  $C, X^+, X^-$  be as in the paragraph preceding the statement of Claim 1. In order to obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , we assume that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 1, we may assume that  $X^+ \neq \emptyset$  by symmetry. By Claim 5(i),  $|X^+| \geq 2p - 1$ . By

Claim 6,  $|V(T) - V(C) - X| = 1$ . Let  $y_0$  be as in the paragraph preceding the statement of Claim 8. Since  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 1$ ,  $|V(T) - X| \geq 2$ , and hence  $X^- = \emptyset$  and  $|V(C)| \geq 3$  by Claim 9. We write the cycle  $C = v_1 v_2 \dots v_l v_1$  ( $l \geq 3$ ). By Claim 8(iv),  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 2p - 1 \geq 3$ . By Claim 9,  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ . Now we divide into the following two cases.

**Case 1.**  $p \geq 3$ .

By Claim 8(v), there exist three vertices  $v_{i_1}, v_{i_2}, v_{i_3} \in V(C)$  ( $1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < i_3 \leq l$ ) such that  $y_0 v_{i_j} \in E(T)$  ( $j = 1, 2, 3$ ). Since  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 3$  and  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ , one of the following holds (subscripts of the letter  $v$  are to be read modulo  $l$ ):

- (1)  $|\{v_{i_1}, \dots, v_{i_3-1}\} \cap X| \geq 2$  and  $|\{v_{i_3}, \dots, v_{i_1-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ ; or
- (2)  $|\{v_{i_2}, \dots, v_{i_1-1}\} \cap X| \geq 2$  and  $|\{v_{i_1}, \dots, v_{i_2-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ ; or
- (3)  $|\{v_{i_3}, \dots, v_{i_2-1}\} \cap X| \geq 2$  and  $|\{v_{i_2}, \dots, v_{i_3-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ .

By arguing as in the proof of Theorem 6, there exists a cycle  $C'$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$  and  $|V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 2$ . Then  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq |V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 2 \geq 2p + 1$ , and hence  $|X| = |V(C) \cap X| + |X^+| \geq 4p$ , which contradicts the definition of  $X$ .

**Case 2.**  $p = 2$ .

By Claim 8(v), there exist two vertices  $v_i, v_j \in V(C)$  ( $1 \leq i < j \leq l$ ) such that  $y_0 v_i, y_0 v_j \in E(T)$ .

First we consider the case where  $j - i \geq 2$  and  $i + l - j \geq 2$ . Since  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq 3$  and  $|V(C) - X| \geq 1$ , one of the following holds (subscripts of the letter  $v$  are to be read modulo  $l$ ):

- (1)  $|\{v_i, \dots, v_{j-1}\} \cap X| \geq 2$  and  $|\{v_j, \dots, v_{i-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ ; or
- (2)  $|\{v_j, \dots, v_{i-1}\} \cap X| \geq 2$  and  $|\{v_i, \dots, v_{j-1}\} \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 1$ .

By arguing as in the proof of Theorem 6, there exists a cycle  $C'$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$  and  $|V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 2$ . Then  $|V(C) \cap X| \geq |V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 2 \geq 2p + 1$ , and hence  $|X| = |V(C) \cap X| + |X^+| \geq 4p$ , which contradicts the definition of  $X$ .

Now we consider the case where  $j - i = 1$  or  $i + l - j = 1$ . We may assume that  $j - i = 1$  by symmetry. Assume for the moment that there exists a path  $Q$  such that the beginning of  $Q$  is  $v_i$  or  $v_j$ ,  $V(Q) \subset V(C)$ ,  $|V(Q) \cap X| \geq 2$ , and  $V(C) - V(Q) - X \neq \emptyset$ . By Claim 8 (i), there exists a path  $P = x_1 x_2 \dots x_{|X^+|} y_0$  ( $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{|X^+|} \in X^+$ ). Hence there exists a cycle  $C' = PQx_1$  such that  $V(T) - V(C') - X \neq \emptyset$  and  $|V(C') \cap X| \geq |X^+| + 2$ . Therefore  $|X| \geq 4p$  by arguing as in the preceding paragraph, which contradicts the definition of  $X$ . Assume now that  $V(C) - V(Q) - X = \emptyset$  for any path  $Q$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} &\text{the beginning of } Q \text{ is } v_i \text{ or } v_j, V(Q) \subset V(C), \quad (*) \\ &\text{and } |V(Q) \cap X| \geq 2. \end{aligned}$$



Let  $Q_0 = v_i C v_{i-1}$  (throughout the end of this paragraph, subscripts of the letter  $v$  are to be read modulo  $l$ ). Since  $|X| \leq 4p - 1$  and  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 2$ ,  $|V(T) - X| \geq 3$ , and hence  $|V(Q_0) \cap (V(T) - X)| \geq 2$ . Since  $V(C) - V(Q) - X = \emptyset$  for any path  $Q$  satisfying  $(*)$ , there exists an integer  $m$  with  $i + 2 \leq m \leq l + i - 2$  such that  $v_{i+1(=j)}, \dots, v_m \in V(T) - X$  and  $v_{m+1}, \dots, v_i \in X$ . Set  $Z_1 = \{v_{i+1}, \dots, v_m\}$  and  $Z_2 = \{v_{m+1}, \dots, v_{i-1}\}$ . Since  $(\{v_m\} \cup Z_2) \cap \{v_i, v_j\} = \emptyset$ ,  $E(\{y_0\}, \{v_m\} \cup Z_2) = \emptyset$ . Then

$$E(X^+ \cup \{y_0\}, \{v_m\}) = \emptyset, \tag{1}$$

and

$$E(X^+ \cup \{y_0\}, Z_2) = \emptyset. \tag{2}$$

Since  $V(C) - V(Q) - X = \emptyset$  for any path  $Q$  satisfying  $(*)$ , we also obtain

$$E(\{v_i, \dots, v_{m-2}, v_{m+1}\}, \{v_m\}) = \emptyset, \tag{3}$$

and

$$E(\{v_i, \dots, v_{m-1}\}, Z_2) = \emptyset. \tag{4}$$

By (1) and (3),  $e(Z_2 - \{v_{m+1}\}, \{v_m\}) \geq 1$ . Let  $w_0 \in Z_2 - \{v_{m+1}\}$  such that  $w_0 v_m \in E(T)$ . By (2) and (4),  $\deg_{\overline{Z_2}}^-(w_0) \geq p$  and  $\deg_{\overline{Z_2}}^-(w) \geq p - 1$  for all  $w \in Z_2 - \{w_0\}$ . By applying Lemma 3 to the tournament  $\langle Z_2 \rangle$ ,  $|Z_2| \geq 2p$ . Therefore  $|X| = |Z_2 \cup \{v_i\}| + |X^+| \geq 4p$ , which contradicts the definition of  $X$ .

Consequently, we obtain  $X \subset V(C)$ , and hence  $|V(C)| = |V(T)| - 1$  by Claim 7. This completes the proof of Theorem 7.  $\square$

## 4 Examples

In this section, we discuss the sharpness of the various conditions in theorems.

**Proposition 1.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. There exists a strongly connected tournament  $T$  with  $|V(T)| = 4p - 1$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , but  $T$  has no  $4p - 1$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p-1}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p - 1$ ) is strongly connected; that is, there exists a subset  $X$  of  $V(T)$  having  $4p - 2$  vertices such that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  be tournaments having  $2p - 1$  vertices such that  $V(T_m) = \{v_1^m, v_2^m, \dots, v_{2p-1}^m\}$  and  $E(T_m) = \{v_i^m v_j^m \mid 1 \leq i \leq 2p - 1, i + 1 \leq j \leq i + p - 1, j \text{ is to be read modulo } 2p - 1\}$  ( $m = 1, 2$ ). We define a tournament  $T$  having  $4p - 1$  vertices by

$$\begin{aligned} V(T) &= V(T_1) \cup V(T_2) \cup \{w_0\}, \\ E(T) &= E(T_1) \cup E(T_2) \\ &\quad \cup \{v w_0 \mid v \in V(T_2)\} \cup \{w_0 v \mid v \in V(T_1)\} \\ &\quad \cup \{uv \mid u \in V(T_1), v \in V(T_2)\}. \end{aligned}$$

Then  $T$  has the desired properties. To see this, set  $X = V(T_1) \cup V(T_2)$ , then  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .  $\square$

**Proposition 2.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. There exists a strongly connected tournament  $T$  with  $|V(T)| = 4p$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , but  $T$  has no  $4p$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p$ ) is strongly connected; that is, there exists a subset  $X$  of  $V(T)$  having  $4p - 1$  vertices such that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. Let  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  be tournaments having  $2p - 1$  vertices such that  $V(T_m) = \{v_1^m, v_2^m, \dots, v_{2p-1}^m\}$  and  $E(T_m) = \{v_i^m v_j^m \mid 1 \leq i \leq 2p - 1, i + 1 \leq j \leq i + p - 1, j \text{ is to be read modulo } 2p - 1\}$  ( $m = 1, 2$ ). We define a tournament  $T$  by

$$\begin{aligned} V(T) &= V(T_1) \cup V(T_2) \cup \{w_1, w_2\}, \\ E(T) &= E(T_1) \cup \{vw_1 \mid v \in V(T_1)\} \cup \{w_2v \mid v \in V(T_1)\} \\ &\quad \cup E(T_2) \cup \{vw_2 \mid v \in V(T_2)\} \cup \{w_1v \mid v \in V(T_2)\} \\ &\quad \cup \{uv \mid u \in V(T_1), v \in V(T_2)\} \cup \{w_1w_2\}. \end{aligned}$$

Then  $T$  has the desired properties. To see this, set  $X = V(T_1) \cup V(T_2) \cup \{w_1\}$ , then  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .  $\square$

Propositions 1 and 2 imply that the cardinality of the set of nonseparating vertices in Theorems 1 and 2 is sharp, and that the bound on the order  $T$  is best possible in Theorems 2 and 3.

**Proposition 3.** *Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer. There exist infinitely many strongly connected tournaments  $T$  with  $|V(T)| \geq 4p + 1$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , but  $T$  has no  $4p + 1$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p+1}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p + 1$ ) is strongly connected; that is, there exists a subset  $X$  of  $V(T)$  having  $4p$  vertices such that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $p \geq 2$  be an integer, and  $l \geq 1$  be an integer. Let  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  be tournaments having  $2p$  vertices such that  $V(T_m) = \{v_1^m, v_2^m, \dots, v_{2p}^m\}$  and  $E(T_m) = \{v_i^m v_j^m \mid 1 \leq i \leq p, i + 1 \leq j \leq i + p\} \cup \{v_i^m v_j^m \mid p + 1 \leq i \leq 2p, i + 1 \leq j \leq i + p - 1, j \text{ is to be read modulo } 2p\}$  ( $m = 1, 2$ ), and let  $T_3$  be a tournament having  $l$  vertices  $v_1^3, v_2^3, \dots, v_l^3$  with  $E(T_3) = E_1 \cup E_2$ , where

$$\begin{aligned} E_1 &= \begin{cases} \{v_i^3 v_{i+1}^3 \mid 1 \leq i \leq l - 1\} & (l \geq 2) \\ \emptyset & (l = 1); \end{cases} \\ E_2 &= \begin{cases} \{v_i^3 v_j^3 \mid 3 \leq i \leq l, 1 \leq j \leq i - 2\} & (l \geq 3) \\ \emptyset & (l \leq 2). \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

We define a tournament  $T$  by

$$\begin{aligned}
 V(T) &= V(T_1) \cup V(T_2) \cup V(T_3), \\
 E(T) &= E(T_1) \cup E(T_2) \cup E(T_3) \\
 &\cup \{v_1^3 v \mid v \in \{v_1^1, \dots, v_p^1\}\} \cup \{v v_1^3 \mid v \in \{v_{p+1}^1, \dots, v_{2p}^1\}\} \\
 &\cup \{v_i^3 v \mid v \in \{v_1^2, \dots, v_p^2\}\} \cup \{v v_i^3 \mid v \in \{v_{p+1}^2, \dots, v_{2p}^2\}\} \\
 &\cup \{uv, vw \mid u \in V(T_2), v \in V(T_3) - \{v_1^3, v_l^3\}, w \in V(T_1)\} \\
 &\cup \{uv \mid u \in V(T_2), v \in V(T_1)\} \cup E_3,
 \end{aligned}$$

where

$$E_3 = \begin{cases} \{v_i^3 v \mid v \in V(T_1)\} \cup \{v v_i^3 \mid v \in V(T_2)\} & (l \geq 2) \\ \emptyset & (l = 1). \end{cases}$$

Then  $T$  has the desired properties. To see this, set  $X = V(T_1) \cup V(T_2)$ , then  $|X| = 4p$ , and  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .  $\square$

**Proposition 4.** *Let  $p = 2$ . There exists a strongly connected tournament  $T$  with  $|V(T)| = 4p + 1$  such that  $\deg_T^+(x) \geq p$  and  $\deg_T^-(x) \geq p$  for all  $x \in V(T)$ , but  $T$  has no  $4p$  vertices  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_{4p}$  such that  $T - x_i$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots, 4p$ ) is strongly connected; that is, there exists a subset  $X$  of  $V(T)$  having  $4p - 1$  vertices such that  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .*

**Proof.** We define a tournament  $T$  having  $4p + 1 = 9$  vertices  $v_1, v_2, \dots, v_9$  by

$$\begin{aligned}
 E(T) &= \{v_1 v_2, v_2 v_3, v_3 v_1\} \cup \{v_7 v_8, v_8 v_9, v_9 v_7\} \\
 &\cup \{v_5 v_i, v_i v_6 \mid 7 \leq i \leq 9\} \cup \{v_6 v_5\} \\
 &\cup \{v_i v_4 \mid 1 \leq i \leq 3, 7 \leq i \leq 9\} \cup \{v_4 v_5, v_4 v_6\} \\
 &\cup \{v_i v_j \mid 5 \leq i \leq 9, 1 \leq j \leq 3\}.
 \end{aligned}$$

Then  $T$  has the desired properties. To see this, set  $X = \{v_i \mid 1 \leq i \leq 3, 6 \leq i \leq 9\}$ , then  $|X| = 4p - 1 = 7$ , and  $X - V(C) \neq \emptyset$  for every cycle  $C$  such that  $|V(C)| \leq |V(T)| - 1$ .  $\square$

Proposition 3 implies that the cardinality of the set of nonseparating vertices in Theorems 3 is sharp. Proposition 4 shows that for  $p = 2$  and  $|V(T)| = 4p - 1$ , a result like Theorem 3 no longer holds.

## Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Professor Yoshimi Egawa for the help he gave to me during the preparation of this paper. I am also grateful to the referees for helpful comments and valuable suggestions toward the improvement of this paper.

## References

- [1] L. Lovász, *Combinatorial problems and exercises*, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1979.
- [2] J. W. Moon, On subtournaments of a tournament, *Canad. Math. Bull.* 9 (1966), 297–301.
- [3] C. Thomassen, Whitney's 2-switching theorem, cycle spaces, and arc mappings of directed graphs, *J. Combin. Theory Ser. B* 46 (1989), 257–291.

(Received 20 Oct 2004; revised 11 May 2006)